

BRISTOL HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION MEETING

Held: November 1, 2012, at Town Hall, 10 Court Street, Bristol, Rhode Island

Present: Chairman Oryann Lima, Members John Allen, Sara Butler, Thomas Enright, Eric Hertfelder

Also Present: Nancy Letendre, Solicitor, Andrew Teitz, Esq., Assistant Town Solicitor

Absent: Victor Cabral

Chairman Lima brought the meeting to order at 7:02PM.

The minutes of the October 4, 2012, meeting were approved as presented. (Allen/Butler 5-0)

1. 12-085 146 High St., Mark Hinken

1. construct new porch; 2. replace windows

Property owner Mark Hinken along with contractor Niles Gregory presented. Staff Assistant photographs were marked Exhibit A, Applicant plans were marked Exhibits NN-UU. Mr. Hinken submitted plans for the new front stairs constructed of granite steps with a mahogany platform (see Exhibit NN). Mr. Hinken submitted product sheets for the skylights, Velux; fiberglass Jeld-Wen doors for the south elevation (Exhibit PP); fiberglass Jeld-Wen two panel door for the bulk head (Exhibit QQ) and Jeld-Wen fiberglass for the east elevation kitchen door (Exhibit UU. New windows for the approved addition will be Jeld-Wen wood for the south elevation (Exhibit RR); Jeld-Wen wood for the east elevation kitchen window (Exhibit TT). Owner has added a new window to the south elevation in the new basement entry, Jeld-Wen wood (Exhibit SS). Mr. Hinken stated he would supply an updated drawing showing the bulkhead window.

Chairman Lima invited comments from the public. There were none.

A motion was made to approve Application 12-085 as presented (and with design modification for an additional window) for the granite stairs, windows and doors (as submitted in Exhibits) in accordance with Secretary of the Interior Standard #9 (Allen/Hertfelder 5-0).

Findings of Facts include that this decision conforms to the Secretary of the Interior Standard: 9 Also, the fiberglass doors will be replacing existing metal doors and the fiberglass windows and doors in the east elevation are in new construction and will not be visible from the street.

Project Monitor: Eric Hertfelder

2. 12-113 146 High St., Mark Hinken

1. garage addition; 2. garage modifications

Property owner Mark Hinken along with contractor Niles Gregory presented. Staff Assistant photographs were marked Exhibit A, Applicant plans were marked Exhibits B-E. Mr. Hinken would like to construct an addition to an existing garage. Construction plans are for a new cupola; to remove window on south elevation and use it on the north elevation; new rear doors to be of tongue and groove shiplap material. Roof shingles to be Owens Corning, asphalt, onyx black; corner boards, soffits and shingles will be cedar.

Commission members noted that the following information must be submitted prior to construction:

Dimensions and material list for cupola

Cut sheet for front doors

Dimensions, material list, window dimensions and material for the rear door.

Member Hertfelder stated he had visited the site and the garage is not an historic structure and will be invisible from the street.

Mr. Allen commended Mr. Hinken for designing the addition so that its reduced size differentiates it from the original garage.

Chairman Lima invited comments from the public. There were none.

A motion was made to approve Application 12-113 as presented with specs for the cupola to be submitted to the Project Monitor prior to construction and material and specs for the front doors and rear doors and windows to be submitted to the staff assistant for the files. Approve move of salvaged south window to north elevation. Decision is in accordance with Secretary of the Interior Standard #9 (Hertfelder/Allen 5-0).

Findings of Facts include that this decision conforms to the Secretary of the Interior Standard: 9

Project Monitor: Eric Hertfelder

3. 12-088 112 Bradford St., Michael & Margaret Rodrigues

replace windows (13)

Property owner Michael Rodrigues presented. Staff Assistant photographs were marked Exhibit A and AA, Applicant plans were marked Exhibits B-N. Mr. Rodrigues is returning to continue the hearing requesting approval to replace 13 windows. Mr. Rodrigues asked that the Commission approve replacement of the windows with Pella Aluminum Clad Wood windows as shown in Exhibit N.

Commissioner Allen asked Mr. Rodrigues if he had solicited any quotes for repairing other than the one (Exhibit M). Mr. Rodrigues answered "no." Mr. Allen said he had an issue with the replacement of historic windows with aluminum clad windows at almost the same cost as repair.

Commissioner Hertfelder stated that it was his impression from the Rhode Island Historical Preservation & Heritage Commission letter dated October 22, 2012, Exhibit AA, regarding Mr. Rodrigues' request for advice about repair or replacement of the windows that Mr. Rodrigues had not taken advantage of Roberta Randall's offer to inspect the windows. Mr. Hertfelder stated that the Commission could not make a Finding of Fact if the windows could not be inspected – there was not enough information about the condition of the windows.

Owner stated that in his opinion the windows need to be replaced.

Member Butler stated she felt it was a reasonable course of action to have the RIHP&HC inspect the windows. Chairman Lima asked Mr. Rodrigues if he would reconsider an inspection of the interior with Roberta Randall. Mr. Rodrigues asked for a vote on his request for the aluminum clad windows.

Solicitor Letendre confirmed that Mr. Rodrigues could submit an application for an alternative window solution at any time. He will not be able to request vinyl covered wood windows for a period of one year.

Member Hertfelder reiterated to Mr. Rodrigues that the RIHP&HC has an enormous amount of information and experience and is willing to help Mr. Rodrigues find a solution for his windows that will meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Chairman Lima invited comments from the public. There were none.

A motion was made to approve Application 12-088 as presented for replacement of 13 windows with Pella Aluminum Clad Wood windows. (Allen/Hertfelder 0-for; 4-against (1-abstention, Thomas Enright). The motion was defeated.

Findings of Facts: Secretary of the Interior Standard #2.

Retain Historic Character – the historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Also, Commission could not approve the removal of historic fabric until the RIHP&HC and this Commission can better inspect the windows.

Chairman Lima recused herself from hearing Application 12-095 and left the room. Vice Chairman Allen assumed the Chair.

4. 12-095 136 Hope St., Thomas, M.R. Deininger
install new fence

Property owner M.R. Deininger presented. Staff Assistant photographs were marked Exhibit A, and AA. Applicant plans were marked Exhibits B-J. Applicant is returning following a site visit on October 19, 2012. Vice Chairman Allen stated that stockade fences have been approved in the past and the Bristol HDC has no restrictions on stockade fences in the District.

Ms. Deininger stated they had replaced an existing 4' picket fence with a 6' stockade fence to match the abutting neighbor to the east. She erected the fence for privacy.

Vice Chairman Allen invited comments from the public. There were none.

A motion was made to approve Application 12-095 as presented for the stockade fence in accordance with Secretary of the Interior Standards #9, 10 (Enright/Hertfelder 4-0).

Findings of Facts include that this decision conforms to the Secretary of the Interior Standards: 9, 10

Chairman Lima returned and resumed the chair.

5. 12-111 102 State St., Deborah Hill

3. install missing plinth on front entry; 4. install PVC vent pipes; 6. install new storm doors

Contractor Jim Tavares presented for the owner. Staff Assistant photographs were marked Exhibit A, Applicant plans were marked Exhibits B-I. It was noted that the PVC vent pipes have already been installed on the west side of the building.

The three full view storm doors are to be installed on the first and second story south elevation and first floor west elevation. The block only on the plinth is to be replaced using like material and will match the existing right hand side plinth.

Chairman Lima invited comments from the public. There were none.

A motion was made to approve Application 12-111 as presented to replace plinth, install storm doors and PVC pipes in accordance with Secretary of the Interior Standards #9, 10 (Enright/Allen 5-0).

Findings of Facts include that this decision conforms to the Secretary of the Interior Standards: 9, 10.

Project Monitor: Thomas Enright

6. 12-112 829 Hope St., Marilyn Housley

partial demolition

Jeff Scorza representing Ms. Housley and the architect presented. Staff Assistant photographs were marked Exhibit A.

The building has already been partially demolished, Chm. Lima told Mr. Scorza that the expectation of the Commission would be that any changes to the original plans should be brought before the Commission for review. Mr. Scorza stated that the insufficient structural problem was not known until the tear down was underway. The owner and the architect made the decision to go ahead with the demolition.

The structure was not historically important nor a contributing building to the District.

Chairman Lima invited comments from the public. There were none.

A motion was made to approve Application 12-112 as presented for partial demolition of the structure and reconstruction of the building as previously approved in accordance with Secretary of the Interior Standard #9 (Enright/Hertfelder 5-0).

Findings of Facts include that this decision conforms to the Secretary of the Interior Standard: 9. Also, the building is not a contributing structure but is in the District and therefore is under the HDC jurisdiction.

Project Monitor: John Allen

7. 12-116 35 Church St., John A. Holmes, Jr.

1. replace fence; 2. replace lights; 3. install new lights

Property owner John Holmes presented. Staff Assistant photographs were marked Exhibit A, Applicant plans were marked Exhibits B-K. Mr. Holmes is requesting approval for a replacement fence which has already been installed and for new exterior lights for the garage and house. Mr. Holmes stated he felt the existing fence was “ugly” and replaced it with a black, steel fence and gate as shown in exhibits. The proposed lights are to be installed on either side of the front garage door and on the side door. The house light is to be installed at the back door, see Exhibit I.

Chairman Lima invited comments from the public. There were none.

A motion was made to approve Application 12-116 as presented for the replacement fence and for the new lights on the garage and rear house door as shown in Exhibit I in accordance with Secretary of the Interior Standard #9 (Butler/Allen 5-0).

Findings of Facts include that this decision conforms to the Secretary of the Interior Standard: 9

Project Monitor: John Allen

8. 12-118 500 Wood St., Bldg. #4, Mosaico B&CDC

install new door

Merritt Meyer presented for Mosaico. Staff Assistant photographs were marked Exhibit A, Applicant plans were marked Exhibits B-G. Application is to install a new door on the south elevation of Building #4. The door model has been approved previously for Building #10 in the complex.

Chairman Lima invited comments from the public. There were none.

A motion was made to approve Application 12-118 as presented to install a new door in Building #4 in accordance with Secretary of the Interior Standard #9 (Hertfelder/Allen 5-0).

Findings of Facts include that this decision conforms to the Secretary of the Interior Standard: 9, also this is a non contributing building in the complex and the door will have no effect on an historic building or the Historic District.

HDC

November 1, 2012

Project Monitor: Oryann Lima

9. 12-120 213 High St., Ann Marie Tortorice

replace windows (2)

Property owner Ann Marie Tortorice and contractor Bob Nichols presented. Staff Assistant photographs were marked Exhibit A, Applicant plans were marked Exhibits B-C. Application is to replace old Anderson windows in a cinderblock south elevation wall. Windows are to be vinyl custom replacements as shown on Exhibit C.

Chairman Lima invited comments from the public. There were none.

A motion was made to approve Application 12-120 as presented for replacement windows noting that the replacements are in a cinderblock wall and the windows to be replaced are modern windows. Decision is in accordance with Secretary of the Interior Standard #9 (Hertfelder/Allen 5-0).

Findings of Facts include that this decision conforms to the Secretary of the Interior Standard: 9. Also, the replacement windows will not be visible from the street and are not replacing original, historic windows.

Project Monitor: Thomas Enright

10. 12-121 43 Byfield St., Ann Marie Tortorice

1. replace gutters on house and garage; 2. replace porch columns; 3. replace front stairs, rails, balusters, as needed; 4. replace storm doors; 5. replace storm windows; 6. repair deck steps and risers; 7. repair garage window sills

Property owner Ann Marie Tortorice and contractor Bob Nichols presented. Staff Assistant photographs were marked Exhibit A, Applicant plans were marked Exhibits B-J. Application is to replace existing wood gutters on the house and garage with aluminum if possible, the gutters will be brown.

Chairman Lima invited comments from the public. There were none.

A motion was made to approve Application 12-121 as presented for replacement of the gutters with aluminum gutters in accordance with Secretary of the Interior Standard #10 (Enright/Butler 4-1 (Allen voting nay).

Findings of Facts include that this decision conforms to the Secretary of the Interior Standard: 10 and the profile of the existing gutters is very simple and the aluminum replacement will do a fair job of replicating existing.

Applicant requests approval to replace the two columns on the left (west) side with fiberglass columns which will look very similar.

Member Hertfelder stated that the columns are a major feature of this house and if the replacements are not the same as the existing it will look odd, and he is against approving any column that is different. Mr. Hertfelder suggested as alternative a wood column with a fiberglass

base. Owner could check with Mr. Barker who is across the street and who replaced similar columns. Member Allen agreed that a wood column with a fiberglass base would be an acceptable substitution to all fiberglass columns. The owner requested a continuance to further research replacement options.

A motion was made to continue Application 12-121 for replacement columns to the December 6, 2012, meeting. (Enright/Butler 5-0).

Owner requests in kind replacement of the front stairs, rails, etc., using mahogany for the replacements.

A motion was made to approve Application 12-121 as presented for in kind replacement of the front stairs, rails, balusters, as needed to match existing in accordance with Secretary of the Interior Standards #6, 9, 10 (Butler/Hertfelder 5-0).

Findings of Facts include that this decision conforms to the Secretary of the Interior Standards: 6, 9, 10

Owner requests replacement of two storm doors on the breezeway with Larson Life Core 278-SS, color almond.

A motion was made to approve Application 12-121 as presented to replace two breezeway storm doors in accordance with Secretary of the Interior Standard #9 (Hertfelder/Butler 5-0).

Findings of Facts include that this decision conforms to the Secretary of the Interior Standard: 9

Owners request to replace storm windows will be continued to December to allow owner to research exactly what she needs. The deck will be repaired using in kind material (pressure treated wood), design, and size.

A motion was made to continue Application 12-121 for storm window replacement to the December 6, 2012, meeting. (Enright/Butler 5-0).

A motion was made to approve Application 12-121 as presented for in kind repair of the rear deck in accordance with Secretary of the Interior Standard #9 (Allen/Hertfelder 5-0).

Findings of Facts include that this decision conforms to the Secretary of the Interior Standard: 9

At owner's request repair of garage window and sills will be continued to the December meeting.

A motion was made to continue Application 12-121 for repair of garage window and sills to the December 6, 2012, meeting.

Project Monitor: Thomas Enright

11. 12-122 151 Ferry Rd., D. Allen and Judith Conaway

install front gate

Property owner Allen Conaway presented. Staff Assistant photographs were marked Exhibit A, Applicant plans were marked Exhibits B-F. Application is to install a two panel, white cedar, 5ft. high gate at the south entrance to the property. The fence will span the 3ft. high stone wall on either side. Mr. Conaway would like the fence to diminish road noise, improve property security and as a safety measure.

Chairman Lima invited comments from the public. Neighbor Catherine Swanson (150 Ferry Road) stated that she felt that Ferry Rd. was a scenic road from which you can see the bay and objects to the gate as configured. She requested that the Commission not allow the gate, "it is too large," she would consider an open design. She also felt an approval would set a precedent for gates along Ferry Rd. Neighbor Alicia Lenarcic, (155 Ferry Rd.) agreed with Mrs. Swanson.

Member Hertfelder stated the Commission should consider the impact on the entire setting of Ferry Rd., and would like owner to consider smoothing lower to follow the height of the existing stone wall. Member Allen asked Mr. Conaway if he would consider an open fence; Mr. Conaway stated he wanted some privacy and protection from the road.

Member Butler questioned the height of the gate in relation to the height of the wall and encouraged owner to explore options more in keeping with the style of the property. Chairman Lima agreed and suggested a more open fence. Owner asked if he needed HDC approval to remove that part of the driveway entrance (south); Solicitor Teitz answered that he would.

It was decided to continue the meeting to a future date to allow the owner to reconsider his options for a gate or hard landscaping. Mr. Conaway requested continuance to the January meeting.

A motion was made to continue Application 12-122 to the January 3, 2013, meeting (Allen/Hertfelder 5-0).

Staff Report:

Staff Approvals – October = 7, copy attached

Project Monitor Report(s)

Project Monitor Butler for Mt. Hope Farm reported that she had met with the new director, Jennifer Bristol, and she feels a good relationship has been established.

Old Business

Chairman Lima noted the awarding of the Frederick C. Williamson Professional Leadership Award to Eric Hertfelder by Preserve Rhode Island and the Rhode Island Historical Preservation & Heritage Commission at a ceremony held October 18, 2012. A copy of recognition attached.

Election of Officers

HDC Secretary Hertfelder entertained nominations for Chairman:

John Allen nominated Oryann Lima for Chairman

No other nominations – the vote in favor was 5-0

Chairman Lima nominated John Allen for Vice Chairman:

No other nominations – the vote in favor was 5-0

Member Enright nominated Eric Hertfelder for Secretary

No other nominations – the vote in favor was 5-0

Adjourn:

A motion to adjourn was unanimously passed at 10:20PM

SC

Date Approved: December 6, 2012